

1 **USING TARGET CAPTURE TO ADDRESS CONSERVATION CHALLENGES:**

2 **POPULATION-LEVEL TRACKING OF A GLOBALLY-TRADED HERBAL MEDICINE.**

3 Vincent Manzanilla*¹, Irene Teixidor-Toneu¹, Gary J. Martin², Peter M. Hollingsworth³, Hugo

4 J. de Boer¹, Anneleen Kool¹

5 ¹ Natural History Museum, University of Oslo, Sars gate 1, 0562 Oslo, Norway

6 ² Global Diversity Foundation, 37 St. Margarets Street, Canterbury, Kent CT1 2TU, England

7 ³ Royal Botanic Garden Edinburgh, Inverleith Row, Edinburgh EH3 5LR, Scotland

8

9 * Corresponding author: Vincent Manzanilla Email: vincent.manzanilla@gmail.com

10 **ABSTRACT**

11 The promotion of responsible and sustainable trade in biological resources is widely proposed
12 as one solution to mitigate currently high levels of global biodiversity loss. Various molecular
13 identification methods have been proposed as appropriate tools for monitoring global supply
14 chains of commercialized animals and plants. We demonstrate the efficacy of target capture
15 genomic barcoding in identifying and establishing the geographic origin of samples traded as
16 *Anacyclus pyrethrum*, a medicinal plant assessed as globally vulnerable in the IUCN Red List
17 of Threatened Species. Samples collected from national and international supply chains were
18 identified through target capture sequencing of 443 low-copy nuclear markers and compared to
19 results derived from genome skimming of plastome, standard plastid barcoding regions and
20 ITS. Both target capture and genome skimming provided approximately 3.4 million reads per
21 sample, but target capture largely outperformed standard plant DNA barcodes and entire
22 plastid genome sequences. Despite the difficulty of distinguishing among closely related
23 species and infraspecific taxa of *Anacyclus* using conventional taxonomic methods, we
24 succeeded in identifying 89 of 110 analysed samples to subspecies level without ambiguity
25 through target capture. Of the remaining samples, we determined that eleven contained plant
26 material from other genera and families and ten were unidentifiable regardless of the method
27 used. Furthermore, we were able to discern the geographical origin of *Anacyclus* samples
28 collected in Moroccan, Indian and Sri Lankan markets, differentiating between plant materials
29 originally harvested from diverse populations in Algeria and Morocco. With a recent drop in
30 the cost of analysing samples, target capture offers the potential to routinely identify
31 commercialized plant species and determine their geographic origin. It promises to play an
32 important role in monitoring and regulation of plant species in trade, supporting biodiversity

33 conservation efforts, and in ensuring that plant products are unadulterated, contributing to
34 consumer protection.

35

36 **Keywords:** Anacyclus, DNA barcoding, genomic barcoding, international trade, supply
37 chain, target capture

38

39 Human exploitation of biological resources is a major challenge for biodiversity conservation
40 and sustainable development. Global trade and consumer demand for natural products provide
41 increasing threats to species (Lenzen et al., 2012), and at the same time create markets in
42 which regulation and authentication are extremely difficult (Newmaster, Grguric,
43 Shanmughanandhan, Ramalingam, & Ragupathy, 2013; WHO, 2004).

44 Many traded plant products from wild populations are over-harvested. Increasing scarcity
45 results in higher prices, and incentivises adulteration, substitution and poaching (Hamilton,
46 2004; Schippmann, Leaman, & Cunningham, 2002; Veldman et al., 2017). In recent decades,
47 multilateral environmental agreements including the Convention on Biological Diversity
48 (CBD) and the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) have
49 addressed the trade of threatened species. In parallel, the World Health Organisation has
50 developed guidelines for safety monitoring of herbal medicines in pharmacovigilance systems
51 (WHO, 2004) and the Food and Agriculture Organisation, through the International Treaty on
52 Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture (ITPGRFA), has set up a multilateral
53 system to promote sustainable agriculture (Esquinas-Alcazar, 2004). However, implementing
54 these regulations and guidelines is hampered by difficulties identifying plant products in
55 trade. Multiple, complex and interacting supply chains can co-exist for a single plant product
56 (A. Booker, Johnston, & Heinrich, 2012). Traded plant products are often not identifiable to
57 species by their morphology or chemistry, as they may be dried, powdered, processed, or
58 commercialised in mixtures with other ingredients. The design, implementation and
59 enforcement of successful conservation actions as well as assessments of product authenticity
60 and quality often require the identification of the geographic origin of species in trade. This is
61 difficult as the development of efficient methods to identify and trace traded products are still
62 in their infancy.

63 DNA barcoding has quickly gained popularity since Hebert et al. (2003) first
64 advocated the use of short and variable DNA sequences, amplified using universal primers,
65 for species identification and discovery of new taxa. DNA barcoding is highly effective for
66 species-level identification in animals using a portion of the mitochondrial marker
67 Cytochrome Oxidase 1 (COI) (P. D. Hebert, Hollingsworth, & Hajibabaei, 2016; P. D.
68 Hebert, Ratnasingham, et al., 2016). In plants, standard DNA barcoding involves one to four
69 plastid DNA regions (*rbcL*, *matK*, *trnH-psbA*, *trnL*), sometimes in combination with internal
70 transcribed spacers of nuclear ribosomal DNA (nrDNA, ITS) (CBOL et al., 2009; Kress,
71 2017). Although these markers are very informative in many cases, no single marker or
72 combination of markers routinely provide complete species-level resolution, especially in
73 species-rich groups, let alone population-level assignment.

74 The development of high throughput sequencing (HTS) with new reagents and
75 platforms expands the application of DNA barcoding in plants in a cost-effective fashion, in
76 part because it removes the need of targeting short universal barcodes (Hollingsworth, Li, van
77 der Bank, & Twyford, 2016; Lemmon & Lemmon, 2013). Two major approaches, shallow
78 pass shotgun sequencing and target capture sequencing, have been proposed for increasing the
79 coverage and resolution of plant DNA barcoding.

80 Shallow pass shotgun sequencing (commonly referred as genome skimming) is used to
81 recover organellar genomes and nuclear ribosomal DNA sequences, increasing the amount of
82 data per sample and leading to some increases in resolution (Manzanilla et al., 2018; Parks,
83 Cronn, & Liston, 2009). Although workflows and bioinformatic pipelines are increasingly
84 refined for this approach, current cost constraints mean that most genome skimming
85 barcoding projects only have sufficient sequencing depth to generate comparative data for
86 multi-copy regions such as plastid genomes and ribosomal DNA. These regions represent a

87 limited number of independent loci, ultimately constraining resolving power (Soltis & Soltis,
88 2009; Wood et al., 2009).

89 Target capture sequencing offers the potential to overcome these deficiencies by
90 efficiently targeting hundreds of low-copy nuclear markers, providing access to a much
91 greater number of independent data points per unit of sequencing effort (Degnan &
92 Rosenberg, 2009). Similar to genome skimming, target capture is successful in sequencing
93 samples with poor DNA integrity (Brewer et al., 2019; Forrest et al., 2019) and allows
94 sequencing hundreds of samples at the same time (Mamanova et al., 2010). It can also be
95 designed to recover standard DNA barcodes in the same assay (Schmickl et al., 2016).

96 Although target capture has been advocated as a powerful tool for molecular identification of
97 plants (Pillon et al., 2013), its usefulness for determining and tracing the origin of plants in
98 trade remained untested.

99 We evaluated the power of target-capture DNA barcoding by investigating the
100 traceability of plant products reputedly derived from a vulnerable medicinal plant species,
101 *Anacyclus pyrethrum* (L.) Lag. In addition to having a well-established international trade
102 chain (Rankou, Ouhammou, Taleb, Manzanilla, & Martin, 2015), this species presents classic
103 challenges for plant molecular identification such as recent radiation, frequent hybridization
104 (Humphries, 1979) and large genome size (Garcia et al., 2013).

105 The genus *Anacyclus* (Asteraceae) comprises 12 species of annual and perennial
106 weedy herbs with partly overlapping geographic ranges around the Mediterranean basin
107 (Humphries, 1979; Rosato, Álvarez, Feliner, & Rosselló, 2017). Some species are abundant
108 and have wide geographical ranges (for example, *A. clavatus* (Desf.) Pers. and *A. radiatus*
109 Loisel.), whereas others are rare and have restricted ranges (for example, *A. maroccanus*
110 (Ball) Ball and *A. pyrethrum* (L.) Lag.).

111 *A. pyrethrum* has a long history of use in traditional Arabic and Islamic, Ayurvedic
112 and European medicine (Adams, Alther, Kessler, Kluge, & Hamburger, 2011; De Vos, 2010;
113 Pittle, 2005). In the 13th century, Ibn al-Baytār wrote that the plant was known across the
114 world and traded from the Maghreb to all other areas (Leclerc, 1877). Its popularity as a
115 medicinal plant stems from the many attested and putative pharmacological activities of its
116 roots (Manouze et al., 2017). Traded from the Maghreb to India (Ved & Goraya, 2007) and
117 Nepal (Tiwari et al., 2004), it is known to be over-harvested and is increasingly difficult to
118 find in local markets in Morocco (Ouarghidi et al., 2013, 2012).

119 There are two accepted varieties, *A. pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* and var. *depressus*,
120 both endemic to Algeria, Morocco, and southern Spain (Humphries, 1979; Rosato et al.,
121 2017). In Morocco, *A. pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* is considered more potent and is up to ten
122 times more expensive than var. *depressus* (Ouarghidi, Powell, Martin, de Boer, & Abbad,
123 2012). Both varieties are harvested from the wild and used extensively for the treatment of
124 pain and inflammatory disorders across Morocco (Ouarghidi, Martin, Powell, Esser, &
125 Abbad, 2013; Ouarghidi et al., 2012) and Algeria (Benarba, 2016; Ouelbani, Bensari, Mouas,
126 & Khelifi, 2016), as well as the Middle East (Pittle, 2005) and the Indian sub-continent
127 (Tiwari, Poudel, & Uprety, 2004). Although collectors are proficient in differentiating the two
128 varieties, material traded as *A. pyrethrum* is adulterated and misidentified along the chain of
129 commercialisation (de Boer, Ouarghidi, Martin, Abbad, & Kool, 2014; Ouarghidi et al., 2013,
130 2012).

131 We applied target-capture genomic barcoding to distinguish *Anacyclus* species and
132 geographical races in root samples in the national and international supply chains. We
133 compare this novel approach with plastid genome and nrDNA ITS barcodes obtained from
134 genome skimming data.

135 MATERIALS AND METHODS

136 **Sample collection.** We made a reference collection of 72 accessions, consisting of 67 of
137 *Anacyclus* and five of closely related genera, including 56 *Anacyclus* accessions and three of
138 closely related genera we collected in Morocco and Spain during field work. We selected a
139 total of 11 samples of *Anacyclus* and two of closely related genera from herbarium voucher
140 specimens of species occurring elsewhere in the Mediterranean. Voucher specimen
141 identifications, collection numbers and locality data are listed in Table S1 and the collection
142 locations are mapped in Figure S1. We purchased 110 samples, each consisting of
143 approximately 50g of roots from collectors, herbalists, middle-men, traditional healer,
144 wholesalers, and export companies in Morocco and India (Table S2).

145 **Trade information.** We obtained samples of commercialized species by asking collectors
146 and traders in Morocco for tiguendizt and iguendez, two vernacular names used for both *A.*
147 *pyrethrum* varieties (Ouarghidi et al., 2012). We asked traders in India for akarkara, a
148 common name used there (Ved & Goraya, 2007). When acquiring the samples, we conducted
149 semi-structured interviews about the roots' trade with 39 informants, enquiring where the
150 plant material was sourced, to whom it was sold and in what quantities, for what price, and if
151 some types of roots were of higher quality than others. We followed the International Society
152 of Ethnobiology Code of Ethics ("ISE Code of Ethics Online," 2018), ensuring free, prior and
153 informed consent, full disclosure and respect for the confidentiality of informants, during all
154 interviews.

155 **Extraction and library preparation.** We extracted DNA of reference and traded vouchers
156 from approximately 40 mg of dry leaf or root material using the DNeasy Plant Mini Kit
157 (Qiagen). Total DNA (0.2-1.0 µg) was sheared to 500 bp fragments using a Covaris S220

158 sonicator (Woburn, MA, USA) (Table S1-2). We prepared dual indexed libraries using the
159 Meyer and Kircher protocol (Meyer & Kircher, 2010) for genome skimming and target
160 capture (BioProject PRJNA631886).

161 **Target capture.** Using the genome assembly of *A. radiatus* subsp. *radiatus*, we designed 872
162 low-copy nuclear markers and associated RNA probes by following the Hyb-Seq pipeline
163 (Weitemier et al., 2014) (SI). For target capture enrichment, we prepared twelve equimolar
164 pools with ten to 24 samples and an average 300 ng of input DNA per pool. The RNA probes
165 were hybridized for 16 hours before target baiting, and 14 PCR cycles were carried out after
166 enrichment following the MyBaits v3 manual. The enriched libraries and genome skimming
167 libraries were sequenced on two Illumina HiSeq 3000 lanes (150bp paired-end).

168 **Data Processing.** We retrieved four datasets from the genome skimming and target capture
169 sequencing methods: (1) standard barcode markers (*matK*, *trnH-psbA*, the *trnL* intron and
170 *rbcL*), (2) ITS, (3) complete plastid genomes (from shotgun genome skimming), and (4)
171 hundreds of nuclear markers (from target capture) (Figure S2). The sequencing runs were
172 trimmed and quality filtered using Trimmomatic (Bolger, Lohse, & Usadel, 2014). Low-copy
173 nuclear markers and their alleles were retrieved for each sample. First, the reads were mapped
174 against the selected low-copy nuclear markers (SI) using BWA v0.7.5a-r40 (Heng Li &
175 Durbin, 2009). Duplicate reads were removed using Picard v2.10.4 (Wysoker, Tibbetts, &
176 Fennell, 2015). Alleles were phased for each marker and individual using SAMtools v1.3.1
177 (H. Li et al., 2009). The last step of the pipeline combined the retrieved alleles into single
178 gene matrices. We recovered plastome and ITS sequences by pooling shotgun and target
179 enrichment sequencing data. Plastid genomes were built using MITOBim v1.8 (Hahn,
180 Bachmann, & Chevreux, 2013). ITS sequences were recovered using BWA by mapping the
181 reads to the reference ITS of *Anacyclus pyrethrum* (KY397478) for *Anacyclus* species and

182 traded samples, to the reference ITS of *Achillea pyrenaica* Sibth. ex Godr. (AY603247) for
183 *Otanthus* and *Achillea*, and to the reference ITS of *Matricaria aurea* (Loefl.) Sch.Bip.
184 (KT954177) for *Matricaria* samples. During the mapping and the assembly steps, we retained
185 sequences only with a minimum coverage of 10X.

186 **Phylogenomics.** We aligned the recovered matrices (nuclear markers, ITS and plastomes)
187 with MAFFT v7.471 (Katoh & Standley, 2013), refined with MUSCLE (Edgar, 2004) and
188 filtered with Gblocks v0.91b (Talavera & Castresana, 2007). Phylogenies were inferred using
189 RAxML v8.0.26 (Stamatakis, 2006), with 1000 bootstrap replicates under the GTRGAMMA
190 model. For the low-copy nuclear markers, the species tree was inferred from the individual
191 nuclear markers trees under the multi-species coalescence (MSC) framework with ASTRAL-
192 III v5.5.9 (Zhang, Sayyari, & Mirarab, 2017). We used the multi-alleles option in ASTRAL-
193 III for reconciliation of the independent evolutionary histories of the alleles. The molecular
194 identification of traded roots was assessed from the MSC tree and posterior probabilities (PP)
195 greater than 0.95. For the ITS phylogenetic reconstruction, we used additional Genbank
196 references (Table S3).

197 We identified traded roots based on morphological characters (described in SI), and we used
198 these to triangulate molecular identifications. Samples were categorised according to their
199 position in the supply chain and geographical origin.

200 **RESULTS**

201 We constructed a reference database of DNA sequences from fresh and herbarium specimens,
202 consisting of 83 individuals of 10 *Anacyclus* species, and 5 individuals representing outgroup
203 species (Figure S1). We used this reference database to assess the identity and geographic

204 origins of 110 root samples acquired from traded materials by comparing the results from the
205 four different datasets (Figure 1). We show that the target capture approach is the most
206 powerful method to identify plant species in trade and discover their geographic origin.

207 **Data recovery for genome skimming and target capture data**

208 After quality control filtering, an average 2.8 million reads (0.42 GB/sample) were obtained
209 per sample from shotgun sequencing and 2.99 million reads (0.43 GB/sample) per sample for
210 target capture (Figure S3, Table S4). The target capture yielded an average coverage of 303X
211 for the 443 nuclear markers, whereas the unenriched genome skimming yielded an average
212 coverage of 12X for the 443 nuclear data, 20X for the plastome data and 131X for the
213 ribosomal data (Table S5). The loci coverage was calculated with *bedtools coverage* (v
214 2.29.2). Samples below an average of 50X coverage in the nuclear dataset show a higher
215 missing data rate (>7%) in the matrices. These samples were automatically discarded with our
216 pipeline (Figure 2, samples in blue). Adulterated samples from other genera have a coverage
217 close to zero (Figure 2, samples in orange, yellow and green). To obtain 100x coverage for the
218 nuclear regions using a genome skimming approach, with an average genome size of the
219 targeted species of 11.72Gb (Garnatje et al., 2011) and a duplication level of the genome
220 skimming libraries of 9% (SI), it would require 14 HiSeq 3000/4000 lanes (Illumina, n.d.).
221 From the genome skimming data we assembled ITS and the standard barcodes markers, as
222 well as the plastome (Figure S2). Out of the 110 trade samples, we succeeded in assembling
223 ITS for 102 samples (93%), the standard barcode regions for 51 to 61 samples (46% to 55%),
224 and plastomes for 49 samples (44%) (Figure 1). The resulting aligned matrices for each of the
225 datasets were 633 bp for ITS (including 5.8S), 4408 bp for the standard barcoding regions,
226 110,003 bp for the plastome and 289,236 bp for the 443 nuclear markers recovered from the

227 target capture approach (Table S1). The standard barcoding regions included the full coding
228 regions of *matK* 1523 bp and *rbcL* 1438 bp, as well as *trnH-psbA* 500 bp and *trnL* 947 bp.
229 The bioinformatics workflow for data analyses is described in Figure S2.

230 **Comparative levels of species discrimination using different approaches**

231 The ITS, plastome, and standard barcodes phylogenies highlight the complex evolutionary
232 history of *Anacyclus*. The ITS phylogeny lacks resolution in general (Figure S4-5). The
233 outgroups *Tanacetum*, *Matricaria*, *Achillea*, *Othanthus* and *Tripleurospermum* have well-
234 supported bootstrap values, but within the genus *Anacyclus*, only *A. atlanticus* Litard. &
235 Maire, *A. maroccanus* and *A. radiatus* are highly supported. The plastome phylogeny shows
236 very good support at genus level for the *Anacyclus* node, and at species level for the
237 outgroups. The lack of variation in the plastid genome within the genus *Anacyclus* results in
238 little phylogenetic support with no species-specific clusters recovered (Figure S6-7). The
239 standard barcode regions, *matK*, *rbcL*, *trnH-psbA* and *trnL* (Figure S8-11) displayed low
240 levels of resolution at the species level, even using the full coding regions of *matK* and *rbcL*
241 (e.g. rather than the 800-900 bp of *matK* and 654 bp of *rbcL* typically recovered using
242 standard barcoding primers (Alsos et al., 2020; Hollingsworth, Graham, & Little, 2011).

243 The 443 nuclear markers recovered by target capture led to a well-resolved phylogeny
244 and high levels of species discrimination: all the genera in the Matricariinae tribe and all
245 interspecific relationships are well-supported, with most nodes showing posterior probabilities
246 (PP) of 1 (Figure 3 and S12). Within *Anacyclus*, all species, sub-species and varieties are well
247 supported. PP are lower for *A. monanthos* (PP = 0.75). The complex of hybrid species
248 composed of *A. clavatus*, *A. homogamos*, and *A. valentinus* is polyphyletic and shows signs of

249 hybridization and incomplete lineage sorting. Intraspecific nodes have PP varying between
250 0.27 and 1, mostly depending on species population structure.

251 **Assessment of *Anacyclus* trade**

252 Interviews with 39 harvesters, middlemen, retailers, and wholesalers in various Moroccan
253 cities indicate that the national and international trade of *Anacyclus pyrethrum* follow two
254 separate supply chains (SI). Retailer herbalists in Moroccan cities are supplied by middlemen
255 who acquire the plant material from local harvesters from rural communities. These retailers
256 typically hold between a few hundred grams to one kilogram of the plant material in their
257 shops. In contrast, wholesalers who export the plant internationally hire professional
258 harvesters who travel across the geographical range of the species to collect plant material.
259 Harvested roots are brought directly from the wild to the export companies in Rabat,
260 Casablanca and Tangier, from where they enter the international market, including supply of
261 material to India. According to informants from export companies, between 3-10 tons of the
262 plant product can be stocked at a time.

263 Our examination of material in trade involved screening a total of 66 samples each
264 containing an average of 25g of dry roots. Initial morphological examination identified
265 obvious non-*Anacyclus* adulterants in 39/66 batches. The adulterants were present in a
266 proportion from 3% to 100% with an average of 42%. The non-*Anacyclus* adulterants were
267 found at high frequency in collections from traditional healers and herbalists, less so from
268 collectors, wholesalers and export companies (Figures 4-5, Table S6).

269 We selected 110 individual roots for DNA analysis from the 66 root batches. Of these
270 99 had a morphology consistent with *Anacyclus*, and 11 which were classed as similar to
271 *Anacyclus* but likely to be non-*Anacyclus* based on their morphology. We recovered partial

272 plastome assemblies of these 11 non-*Anacyclus* roots and using sequence queries against
273 GenBank, we obtained identifications for nine *Plantago* spp., one *Primula* spp. and one
274 *Plumeria* spp. (Figure S13, Table S2).

275 Of the 99 *Anacyclus* roots, 10 had no identifiable DNA sequences via any of our
276 methods, with all of the remaining samples identified through target capture (Figure S13). The
277 ten discarded samples presented very fragmented plastome assemblies with average 89%
278 missing data in the nuclear matrices. These samples had a very low DNA integrity.

279 The plastome sequences enabled identification of seven roots to the species level, with
280 the remainder identified as *Anacyclus* sp. (Figure 1, Table S7). Neither ITS nor any of the
281 standard barcode regions were able to discriminate any of these samples below the genus
282 level (Figure 1, S4-5, S8-11).

283 The nuclear markers gave much higher resolution within *Anacyclus* (Table S2, S7).
284 For plant material traded within Morocco, our analyses of six individual root samples from
285 four rural community collectors identified three *Anacyclus* var. *pyrethrum* and three var.
286 *depressus*. Our analysis of five samples from three wholesaler ‘middle-men’ in Morocco
287 identified two *Anacyclus* var. *pyrethrum* and three var. *depressus*. Our sequences from 19
288 samples from 10 herbalists revealed 12 *A. pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* and seven var. *depressus*.
289 Likewise, our 11 samples from six traditional healer sources identified seven *A. pyrethrum*
290 var. *pyrethrum*, and four var. *depressus*. For material traded in international markets, our 17
291 sequenced samples from three export companies in Morocco identified nine *A. pyrethrum* var.
292 *pyrethrum*, six var. *depressus*, and two *A. homogamous*. Our analysis of 30 samples from 17
293 herbalists in India identified three *A. pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* and 27 var. *depressus*.

294 **Geographical source**

295 Market samples in Morocco originate from various Moroccan areas as well as Algeria, and
296 material from all of these populations of origin can be found in Indian market samples (Table
297 S1, Figure 3, 6). Of the 99 non-adulterated roots identified to species level using target
298 capture, we were able to associate 67% to a specific geographic region (Figure 1, 3, Table
299 S1). Using phylogenetic analysis, root samples of *A. pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* clustered with
300 reference material from the High Atlas (Figure 6, case 4), and *A. pyrethrum* var. *depressus*
301 roots clustered with reference material from different regions in Morocco, including the Rif
302 Mountains, the High Atlas and the Middle Atlas (Figure 6, case 2 and 3). Evidence for the
303 international trade from Algeria to Morocco is highlighted by a distinctive clade that includes
304 traded roots collected from west Algeria (Figure 6, case 1). The geographic origin was only
305 resolvable with target capture data; standard barcoding regions, ITS and plastome data lacked
306 variation, resolution or both (Figure 1).

307 **DISCUSSION**

308 This study illustrates the potential for target-capture based DNA barcoding to form the next
309 wave of standard plant DNA-barcoding tools and provide greatly needed species-level
310 resolution. A key rate limiting step for the standard plant barcodes is that they are
311 fundamentally recovering data from just one or two independent loci (plastid DNA and ITS),
312 which often show trans-specific polymorphism and barcode sharing among related species
313 (Hollingsworth, Graham, & Little, 2011). The use of complete plastid genome sequences
314 suffers from the same problem, as the data are all physically linked in a single non-
315 recombinant uni-parentally inherited locus. Several recent hybridization events have occurred
316 in the *Anacyclus* genus and entire plastid genomes or plastid barcode markers, and/or ITS
317 provide limited resolution below genus level (Figure 1). In contrast, our target capture

318 approach using hundreds of nuclear markers yields significantly higher molecular
319 identification success and more accurate resolution to species and even population level
320 (Figure 1).

321 *Species identification, species in trade, and geographic origins of Anacyclus*

322 These data provide new insights into trade of *A. pyrethrum* and highlight the extent of
323 adulteration and scarcity of *A. pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* (Figures 2-3, 6). Only a small
324 proportion of the tested samples from herbalists and traditional healers were the potent *A.*
325 *pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum*, with the Indian market in particular dominated by var. *depressus*.
326 In both Morocco and India some individual sellers had entirely or almost entirely adulterated
327 products. Most of the non-*Anacyclus* roots we sequenced were identified as *Plantago* spp. by
328 shotgun sequencing, despite being sampled from six different localities including Morocco
329 and India. As *Plantago* roots are similar in appearance to those of *Anacyclus*, it is possible
330 that they are deliberately added as a ‘difficult to identify’ adulterant which may go unnoticed
331 by non-specialists.

332 Our analysis of samples from collectors, wholesalers and export companies detected
333 much less adulteration at this point in the supply chain (Figure 4, Table S6). Collection of *A.*
334 *pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum* is carried out by professional harvesters employed by export
335 companies who travel across the country and are considered poachers by local communities
336 (Ouarghidi, Powell, Martin, & Abbad, 2017). Local harvesters have increasing difficulty to
337 supply local trade chains (Ouarghidi et al., 2017, 2012), which may finally result in increased
338 adulteration rates in the poorly-governed, national value chains (Figure 4), as has also been
339 observed elsewhere (A. Booker et al., 2012) . Our results also identify previously unreported
340 international trade in North Africa prior to export to the Indian sub-continent (Figure 3, 6).

341 We provide evidence that export companies in Morocco source material not only in this
342 country, but also from neighbouring Algeria (Figure 6). Applying this molecular identification
343 approach enables us to distinguish samples at population level and uncover these hidden
344 international sourcing channels.

345 **Conservation of *A. pyrethrum***

346 High national and international demand for *A. pyrethrum* likely encourages its
347 overharvesting and adulteration. As the plant is a remedy of the Indian pharmacopoeia, its
348 demand is likely to increase along with that of other Ayurvedic medicines (Kala, Dhyani, &
349 Sajwan, 2006). Although *A. pyrethrum* has been assessed to be vulnerable globally (Rankou
350 et al., 2015) and endangered in Morocco on the IUCN Red List, the plant is not listed in the
351 CITES appendices and its international trade is not regulated. Nonetheless, continued
352 overharvesting is driving wild populations to critical levels of depletion and conservation
353 policies are necessary. Common strategies to conserve overharvested medicinal plants include
354 collection and trade restrictions as well as cultivation (Schippmann et al., 2002). Cultivation is
355 often proposed as a solution to both conservation issues and sourcing high quality,
356 appropriately identified material (Hamilton, 2004; Schippmann, Leaman, & Cunningham,
357 2006; Schippmann et al., 2002). Cultivation necessitates engagement with local communities
358 that depend on plant harvest, as well as monitoring of professional trading networks. Both
359 promotion of sustainable harvesting for livelihood security as well as restriction of
360 unsustainable professional trade may be needed. Only with fine-grained mapping of sourcing
361 areas and supply chains, as our results highlight for *A. pyrethrum*, can meaningful
362 conservation action be achieved. With the implementation of target enrichment, we identified
363 the origin of the harvested populations of medicinal or traded populations and indicate where
364 conservation efforts could be initially implemented. We also reveal previously undocumented

365 harvesting and trade in Algeria (Figure 6, case 1), and show that *Anacyclus* is harvested at a
366 national scale in Morocco (Figure 6, case 2-4). This study gives scientific evidence to support
367 conservation initiatives like Global Diversity Foundation's High Atlas Cultural Landscapes
368 Programme and potentially encourage future *Anacyclus* conservation projects.

369

370 *Future prospects for plant DNA barcoding*

371 Key criteria for developing new DNA barcoding approaches for plants include resolving
372 power (differentiating between taxa and discovering their geographical origins),
373 recoverability (enabling use on a wide diversity of tissue sources), and cost and efficiency
374 (enabling scaling over very large sample sets).

375 In terms of resolving power, the target capture approach used here offers substantial
376 improvement compared to plant barcodes based on plastid sequences and ITS. The key
377 enabling step is access to multiple nuclear markers, as this reduces sensitivity of the
378 identification to predominance by one or two loci as is the case for barcodes from rDNA or
379 the plastid genome. In this study, we show high resolution from nuclear markers retrieved by
380 target capture for identification of species in a genus that has undergone recent hybridization
381 events (Manzanilla, 2018). The successful recovery of these markers from low quality input
382 DNA is also important and the combination of these observations makes the case that this
383 method provides a viable solution for future plant barcoding. In contrast, shotgun sequencing
384 requires a substantial sequencing effort to retrieve the same suite of nuclear markers for
385 species with large genomes. Thus for *Anacyclus* it would require 14 HiSeq 3000 lanes to
386 obtain the same coverage of the loci we have used here. Overall, and regardless of approach,
387 our findings provide empirical evidence to support predictions made in previous review

388 papers (Hollingsworth et al., 2016) that barcoding based on nuclear markers should
389 outperform standard barcoding methods.

390 The successful recovery of sequences via target capture depends on how closely
391 related the sampled species are to the reference set on which the baits were designed, and/or
392 the level of variation in the loci that form the bait set (McCormack, Tsai, & Faircloth, 2016;
393 Paijmans, Fickel, Courtiol, Hofreiter, & Förster, 2016). In the current study, the baits were
394 designed from *Anacyclus* and related genera. This optimized their specificity to our study
395 group and enabled their successful high-resolution application for assessing trade. A clear
396 challenge for wider use of target capture is applicability over much greater phylogenetic
397 distances. The recently published universal angiosperm bait kit (Buddenhagen et al., 2016;
398 Johnson et al., 2018) designed to recover 353 loci from a wide diversity of flowering plants
399 offer great potential here, as they can provide species and population-level resolution (Van
400 Andel et al., 2019). There is a need for a more general evaluation of when, how and at what
401 scale to most effectively combine taxon-specific bait sets with universal bait sets to
402 simultaneously obtain very high resolution and sequencing success over wide phylogenetic
403 distances.

404 Another important aspect of recoverability is efficacy with degraded DNA. Drying,
405 storage, and transportation affect the quality of plant material in trade and can cause extensive
406 DNA degradation (Anthony Booker et al., 2014). In consequence, traded samples have similar
407 challenges to working with ancient DNA, herbarium samples or archaeological remains.
408 Target capture is particularly well suited to this challenge (McCormack et al., 2016; Paijmans
409 et al., 2016). Although shotgun sequencing can also be very effective on degraded material
410 (Alsos et al., 2020; Bakker, 2017; Zeng et al., 2018), our recovery rate in this study was
411 greater for target capture than shotgun sequencing (Figure 1), and we recovered data from

412 100% of the samples used for establishing the reference library and over 70% of the samples
413 in trade. This success rate for hundreds of nuclear markers providing high resolution from
414 suboptimal tissue of traded samples is noteworthy. The other mainstream approach for highly
415 degraded DNA is sequencing a portion of the chloroplast *trnL* (UAA) intron, specifically the
416 P6 loop (10–143 bp) (Taberlet et al., 2007), which has been highly successful in recovering
417 sequence data from degraded samples (Parducci et al., 2012; Willerslev et al., 2014).
418 However, this short region of the plastid genome has a low variation at the species level and
419 does not typically discriminate among con-generic species (Taberlet et al., 2007).

420 The target capture methodology presented here, including library construction and
421 sequencing, cost 70 USD per sample in 2016, a price similar to those presented by Hale et al.
422 (2020). With the optimisations suggested in Hale et al. (2020), prices drop to 22 USD per
423 sample. Thus, this target enrichment approach is quickly becoming affordable for large-scale
424 biomonitoring projects. With a growing interest and investment in DNA-based identification
425 solutions in medicine and industry (Afshinnekoo et al., 2017; Menegon et al., 2017), ongoing
426 work is expected to continue to optimize protocols and drive these costs down even further,
427 reaching those of standard barcoding approaches (Hebert et al., 2018).

428 CONCLUSION

429 In plants, the frequent sharing of plastid and ribosomal sequences among con-generic
430 species, coupled with the difficulty of routinely accessing multiple nuclear markers, has acted
431 as a constraint on the resolution of DNA barcoding approaches. Current advances in
432 sequencing technology and bioinformatics are removing this constraint and offer the potential
433 for a new wave of high-resolution identification tools for plants. These approaches, such as

434 target capture have the capability to distinguish species and populations, providing insights
435 into diversity and ecology, as well as the multitude of societal applications which require
436 information on the identification and provenance of biological materials.

437

438 REFERENCES

- 439 Adams, M., Alther, W., Kessler, M., Kluge, M., & Hamburger, M. (2011). Malaria in the
 440 Renaissance: remedies from European herbals from the 16th and 17th century. *Journal*
 441 *of Ethnopharmacology*, *133*(2), 278–288.
- 442 Afshinnekoo, E., Chou, C., Alexander, N., Ahsanuddin, S., Schuetz, A. N., & Mason, C. E.
 443 (2017). Precision metagenomics: rapid metagenomic analyses for infectious disease
 444 diagnostics and public health surveillance. *Journal of Biomolecular Techniques: JBT*,
 445 *28*(1), 40.
- 446 Alam, G., & Belt, J. (2009). Developing a medicinal plant value chain: Lessons from an
 447 initiative to cultivate Kutki (*Picrorhiza kurrooa*) in Northern India. *KIT Working*
 448 *Papers Series*, (WPS. C5).
- 449 Bakker, F. T. (2017). Herbarium genomics: skimming and plastomics from archival
 450 specimens. *Webbia*, *72*(1), 35–45.
- 451 Benarba, B. (2016). Medicinal plants used by traditional healers from South-West Algeria: An
 452 ethnobotanical study. *Journal of Intercultural Ethnopharmacology*, *5*(4), 320.
- 453 Bolger, A. M., Lohse, M., & Usadel, B. (2014). Trimmomatic: a flexible trimmer for Illumina
 454 sequence data. *Bioinformatics*, *30*(15), 2114–2120. doi:
 455 10.1093/bioinformatics/btu170
- 456 Booker, A., Johnston, D., & Heinrich, M. (2012). Value chains of herbal medicines-Research
 457 needs and key challenges in the context of ethnopharmacology. *Journal of*
 458 *Ethnopharmacology*, *140*(3), 624–633. doi: 10.1016/j.jep.2012.01.039
- 459 Booker, Anthony, Frommenwiler, D., Johnston, D., Umealajekwu, C., Reich, E., & Heinrich,
 460 M. (2014). Chemical variability along the value chains of turmeric (*Curcuma longa*): a
 461 comparison of nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy and high performance thin
 462 layer chromatography. *Journal of Ethnopharmacology*, *152*(2), 292–301.
- 463 Buddenhagen, C., Lemmon, A. R., Lemmon, E. M., Bruhl, J., Cappa, J., Clement, W. L., ...
 464 Kortyna, M. (2016). Anchored phylogenomics of angiosperms I: Assessing the
 465 robustness of phylogenetic estimates. *BioRxiv*, 086298.
- 466 de Boer, H. J., Ouarghidi, A., Martin, G., Abbad, A., & Kool, A. (2014). DNA barcoding
 467 reveals limited accuracy of identifications based on folk taxonomy. *PLoS ONE*, *9*(1),

- 468 e84291. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0084291
- 469 De Vos, P. (2010). European materia medica in historical texts: longevity of a tradition and
470 implications for future use. *Journal of Ethnopharmacology*, 132(1), 28–47.
- 471 Degnan, J. H., & Rosenberg, N. A. (2009). Gene tree discordance, phylogenetic inference and
472 the multispecies coalescent. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, 24(6), 332–340.
- 473 Edgar, R. C. (2004). MUSCLE: multiple sequence alignment with high accuracy and high
474 throughput. *Nucleic Acids Research*, 32(5), 1792–1797.
- 475 Esquinas-Alcazar, J. (2004). International treaty on plant genetic resources for food and
476 agriculture. *Plant Genetic Resources Newsletter*.
- 477 Fazekas, A. J., Kesanakurti, P. R., Burgess, K. S., Percy, D. M., Graham, S. W., Barrett, S. C.,
478 ... Husband, B. C. (2009). Are plant species inherently harder to discriminate than
479 animal species using DNA barcoding markers? *Molecular Ecology Resources*, 9(s1),
480 130–139.
- 481 Garcia, S., Hidalgo, O., Jakovljević, I., Siljak-Yakovlev, S., Vigo, J., Garnatje, T., & Vallès,
482 J. (2013). New data on genome size in 128 Asteraceae species and subspecies, with
483 first assessments for 40 genera, 3 tribes and 2 subfamilies. *Plant Biosystems - An
484 International Journal Dealing with All Aspects of Plant Biology*, 147(4), 1219–1227.
485 doi: 10.1080/11263504.2013.863811
- 486 Garnatje, T., Canela, M. A., Garcia, S., Hidalgo, O., Pellicer, J., Sánchez-Jiménez, I., ...
487 Vallès, J. (2011). *GSAD: A genome size in the Asteraceae database*.
- 488 Hahn, C., Bachmann, L., & Chevreux, B. (2013). Reconstructing mitochondrial genomes
489 directly from genomic next-generation sequencing reads—a baiting and iterative
490 mapping approach. *Nucleic Acids Research*, 41(13), e129–e129.
- 491 Hamilton, A. (2004). Medicinal plants, conservation and livelihoods. *Biodiversity &
492 Conservation*, 13(8), 1477–1517. doi: 10.1023/B:BIOC.0000021333.23413.42
- 493 Hebert, P. D., Braukmann, T. W., Prosser, S. W., Ratnasingham, S., deWaard, J. R., Ivanova,
494 N. V., ... Sones, J. E. (2018). A Sequel to Sanger: amplicon sequencing that scales.
495 *BMC Genomics*, 19(1), 219.
- 496 Hollingsworth, P. M. (2011). Refining the DNA barcode for land plants. *Proceedings of the
497 National Academy of Sciences*, 108(49), 19451–19452. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1116812108
- 498 Hollingsworth, P. M., Graham, S. W., & Little, D. P. (2011). Choosing and Using a Plant
499 DNA Barcode. *PLoS ONE*, 6(5), e19254. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0019254

- 500 Hollingsworth, P. M., Li, D.-Z., van der Bank, M., & Twyford, A. D. (2016). Telling plant
501 species apart with DNA: from barcodes to genomes. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B*, *371*(1702),
502 20150338.
- 503 Humphries, C. J. (1979). A revision of the genus *Anacyclus* L. (Compositae: Anthemideae).
504 *Bulletin of the British Museum (Natural History), Historical Series*, (7), 83–142.
- 505 ISE Code of Ethics Online. (2018, March). Retrieved March 3, 2018, from International
506 Society of Ethnobiology website: [http://www.ethnobiology.net/what-we-do/core-](http://www.ethnobiology.net/what-we-do/core-programs/ise-ethics-program/code-of-ethics/code-in-english/)
507 [programs/ise-ethics-program/code-of-ethics/code-in-english/](http://www.ethnobiology.net/what-we-do/core-programs/ise-ethics-program/code-of-ethics/code-in-english/)
- 508 Johnson, M. G., Pokorny, L., Dodsworth, S., Botigué, L. R., Cowan, R. S., Devault, A., ...
509 Kim, J. T. (2018). A universal probe set for targeted sequencing of 353 nuclear genes
510 from any flowering plant designed using k-medoids clustering. *Systematic Biology*,
511 *68*(4), 594–606.
- 512 Kala, C. P., Dhyani, P. P., & Sajwan, B. S. (2006). Developing the medicinal plants sector in
513 northern India: challenges and opportunities. *Journal of Ethnobiology and*
514 *Ethnomedicine*, *2*(1), 32.
- 515 Katoh, K., & Standley, D. M. (2013). MAFFT multiple sequence alignment software version
516 7: improvements in performance and usability. *Molecular Biology and Evolution*,
517 *30*(4), 772–780.
- 518 Leclerc, L. (1877). *Traité des simples* (Vol. 1). Imprimerie nationale.
- 519 Lemmon, E. M., & Lemmon, A. R. (2013). High-throughput genomic data in systematics and
520 phylogenetics. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, *44*, 99–121.
- 521 Lenzen, M., Moran, D., Kanemoto, K., Foran, B., Lobefaro, L., & Geschke, A. (2012).
522 International trade drives biodiversity threats in developing nations. *Nature*,
523 *486*(7401), 109.
- 524 Li, H., Handsaker, B., Wysoker, A., Fennell, T., Ruan, J., & Homer, N. (2009). Genome
525 project data processing S. The sequence alignment/Map format and SAMtools.
526 *Bioinformatics*, *25*. doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btp352
- 527 Li, Heng, & Durbin, R. (2009). Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows–Wheeler
528 transform. *Bioinformatics*, *25*(14), 1754–1760. doi: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btp324
- 529 Mamanova, L., Coffey, A. J., Scott, C. E., Kozarewa, I., Turner, E. H., Kumar, A., ... Turner,
530 D. J. (2010). Target-enrichment strategies for next-generation sequencing. *Nature*
531 *Methods*, *7*(2), 111.

- 532 Manouze, H., Bouchatta, O., Gadhi, A. C., Bennis, M., Sokar, Z., & Ba-M'hamed, S. (2017).
533 Anti-inflammatory, antinociceptive, and antioxidant activities of methanol and
534 aqueous extracts of *Anacyclus pyrethrum* roots. *Frontiers in Pharmacology*, *8*, 598.
- 535 Manzanilla, V., Kool, A., Nguyen Nhat, L., Nong Van, H., Le Thi Thu, H., & de Boer, H. J.
536 (2018). Phylogenomics and barcoding of *Panax*: toward the identification of ginseng
537 species. *BMC Evolutionary Biology*, *18*(1), 44. doi: 10.1186/s12862-018-1160-y
- 538 McCormack, J. E., Tsai, W. L., & Faircloth, B. C. (2016). Sequence capture of ultraconserved
539 elements from bird museum specimens. *Molecular Ecology Resources*, *16*(5), 1189–
540 1203.
- 541 Menegon, M., Cantaloni, C., Rodriguez-Prieto, A., Centomo, C., Abdelfattah, A., Rossato,
542 M., ... Delledonne, M. (2017). On site DNA barcoding by nanopore sequencing. *PLoS*
543 *One*, *12*(10).
- 544 Meyer, M., & Kircher, M. (2010). Illumina Sequencing Library Preparation for Highly
545 Multiplexed Target Capture and Sequencing. *Cold Spring Harbor Protocols*, *2010*(6),
546 pdb.prot5448. doi: 10.1101/pdb.prot5448
- 547 Newmaster, S., Grguric, M., Shanmughanandhan, D., Ramalingam, S., & Ragupathy, S.
548 (2013). DNA barcoding detects contamination and substitution in North American
549 herbal products. *BMC Medicine*, *11*(1), 222. (doi:10.1186/1741-7015-11-222).
- 550 Ouarghidi, A., Martin, G., Powell, B., Esser, G., & Abbad, A. (2013). Botanical identification
551 of medicinal roots collected and traded in Morocco and comparison to the existing
552 literature. *Journal of Ethnobiology and Ethnomedicine*, *9*(1), 59. (doi:10.1186/1746-
553 4269-9-59).
- 554 Ouarghidi, A., Powell, B., Martin, G. J., & Abbad, A. (2017). Traditional Sustainable
555 Harvesting Knowledge and Distribution of a Vulnerable Wild Medicinal Root (*A.*
556 *pyrethrum* var. *pyrethrum*) in Ait M'hamed Valley, Morocco. *Economic Botany*,
557 *71*(1), 83–95.
- 558 Ouarghidi, A., Powell, B., Martin, G. J., De Boer, H., & Abbad, A. (2012). Species
559 substitution in medicinal roots and possible implications for toxicity of herbal
560 remedies in Morocco. *Economic Botany*, *66*(4), 370–382.
- 561 Ouelbani, R., Bensari, S., Mouas, T. N., & Khelifi, D. (2016). Ethnobotanical investigations
562 on plants used in folk medicine in the regions of Constantine and Mila (North-East of
563 Algeria). *Journal of Ethnopharmacology*, *194*, 196–218.

- 564 Pajmans, J. L., Fickel, J., Courtiol, A., Hofreiter, M., & Förster, D. W. (2016). Impact of
 565 enrichment conditions on cross-species capture of fresh and degraded DNA.
 566 *Molecular Ecology Resources*, 16(1), 42–55.
- 567 Parducci, L., Jørgensen, T., Tollefsrud, M. M., Elverland, E., Alm, T., Fontana, S. L., ...
 568 Willerslev, E. (2012). Glacial Survival of Boreal Trees in Northern Scandinavia.
 569 *Science*, 335(6072), 1083–1086. doi: 10.1126/science.1216043
- 570 Parks, M., Cronn, R., & Liston, A. (2009). Increasing phylogenetic resolution at low
 571 taxonomic levels using massively parallel sequencing of chloroplast genomes. *BMC*
 572 *Biology*, 7(1), 84.
- 573 Pillon, Y., Johansen, J., Sakishima, T., Chamala, S., Barbazuk, W. B., Roalson, E. H., ...
 574 Stacy, E. A. (2013). Potential use of low-copy nuclear genes in DNA barcoding: a
 575 comparison with plastid genes in two Hawaiian plant radiations. *BMC Evolutionary*
 576 *Biology*, 13(1), 35.
- 577 Pittle, K. D. (2005). *Continuity and Change in Islamic Ethnopharmacological Practice: New*
 578 *Methods for Cognitive Dialectometry*. Florida State University.
- 579 Rankou, H., Ouhammou, A., Taleb, M., Manzanilla, V., & Martin, G. (2015). *Anacyclus*
 580 *pyrethrum*. *The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species 2015: E.T202924A53798702*,
 581 2015(2015). Retrieved from [http://dx.doi.org/10.2305/IUCN.UK.2015-](http://dx.doi.org/10.2305/IUCN.UK.2015-4.RLTS.T202924A53798702.en)
 582 4.RLTS.T202924A53798702.en
- 583 Rosato, M., Álvarez, I., Feliner, G. N., & Rosselló, J. A. (2017). High and uneven levels of
 584 45S rDNA site-number variation across wild populations of a diploid plant genus
 585 (*Anacyclus*, Asteraceae). *PloS One*, 12(10), e0187131.
- 586 Särkinen, T., Staats, M., Richardson, J. E., Cowan, R. S., & Bakker, F. T. (2012). How to
 587 open the treasure chest? Optimising DNA extraction from herbarium specimens. *PloS*
 588 *One*, 7(8), e43808.
- 589 Schippmann, U., Leaman, D., & Cunningham, A. (2006). A comparison of cultivation and
 590 wild collection of medicinal and aromatic plants under sustainability aspects. *Frontis*,
 591 75–95.
- 592 Schippmann, U., Leaman, D. J., & Cunningham, A. (2002). Impact of cultivation and
 593 gathering of medicinal plants on biodiversity: global trends and issues. *Biodiversity*
 594 *and the Ecosystem Approach in Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries*.
- 595 Schmickl, R., Liston, A., Zeisek, V., Oberlander, K., Weitemier, K., Straub, S. C. K., ...

- 596 Suda, J. (2016). Phylogenetic marker development for target enrichment from
 597 transcriptome and genome skim data: the pipeline and its application in southern
 598 African *Oxalis* (Oxalidaceae). *Molecular Ecology Resources*, 16(5), 1124–1135. doi:
 599 10.1111/1755-0998.12487
- 600 Soltis, P. S., & Soltis, D. E. (2009). The Role of Hybridization in Plant Speciation. *Annual*
 601 *Review of Plant Biology*, 60(1), 561–588. doi:
 602 10.1146/annurev.arplant.043008.092039
- 603 Stamatakis, A. (2006). RAxML-VI-HPC: maximum likelihood-based phylogenetic analyses
 604 with thousands of taxa and mixed models. *Bioinformatics*, 22(21), 2688–2690.
- 605 Taberlet, P., Coissac, E., Pompanon, F., Gielly, L., Miquel, C., Valentini, A., ... Willerslev,
 606 E. (2007). Power and limitations of the chloroplast trnL (UAA) intron for plant DNA
 607 barcoding. *Nucleic Acids Research*, 35(3), e14. doi: 10.1093/nar/gkl938
- 608 Talavera, G., & Castresana, J. (2007). Improvement of phylogenies after removing divergent
 609 and ambiguously aligned blocks from protein sequence alignments. *Systematic*
 610 *Biology*, 56(4), 564–577.
- 611 Tiwari, N. N., Poudel, R. C., & Uprety, Y. (2004). Study on domestic market of medicinal
 612 and aromatic plants (MAPs) in Kathmandu Valley. *Kathmandu: Winrock*
 613 *International*.
- 614 Ved, D., & Goraya, G. (2007). Demand and supply of medicinal plants in India. *NMPB, New*
 615 *Delhi & FRLHT, Bangalore, India*, 18.
- 616 Veldman, S., Gravendeel, B., Otieno, J. N., Lammers, Y., Duijm, E., Nieman, A., ... van
 617 Andel, T. R. (2017). High-throughput sequencing of African chikanda cake highlights
 618 conservation challenges in orchids. *Biodiversity and Conservation*, 26(9), 2029–2046.
- 619 WHO. (2004). *WHO guidelines on safety monitoring of herbal medicines in*
 620 *pharmacovigilance systems*.
- 621 Willerslev, E., Davison, J., Moora, M., Zobel, M., Coissac, E., Edwards, M. E., ... Taberlet,
 622 P. (2014). Fifty thousand years of Arctic vegetation and megafaunal diet. *Nature*,
 623 506(7486), 47–51. doi: 10.1038/nature12921
- 624 Wood, T. E., Takebayashi, N., Barker, M. S., Mayrose, I., Greenspoon, P. B., & Rieseberg, L.
 625 H. (2009). The frequency of polyploid speciation in vascular plants. *Proc Natl Acad*
 626 *Sci U S A*, 106. doi: 10.1073/pnas.0811575106
- 627 Wysocker, A., Tibbetts, K., & Fennell, T. (2015). *Picard tools*. Broad Institute.

628 Zeng, C.-X., Hollingsworth, P. M., Yang, J., He, Z.-S., Zhang, Z.-R., Li, D.-Z., & Yang, J.-B.
629 (2018). Genome skimming herbarium specimens for DNA barcoding and
630 phylogenomics. *Plant Methods*, 14(1), 43.

631 Zhang, C., Sayyari, E., & Mirarab, S. (2017). *ASTRAL-III: Increased Scalability and Impacts*
632 *of Contracting Low Support Branches*. 53–75. Springer.

633

634

635 DECLARATIONS**636 Authors' contributions**

637 The project was coordinated by AK, GM, HdB and VM. VM did the design of the study and
638 performed data analysis. AK, HdB, ITT, PH and VM wrote the manuscript. All authors
639 provided useful contributions to data analysis and interpretation of the results. All authors
640 have read and approved the final version of the manuscript.

641 Acknowledgments

642 Maxime Borry for the DNA extraction; Julie Hawkins for hosting V.M. in Reading during the
643 phylogenomics analyses; the Global Diversity Foundation team in Morocco for their logistic
644 support during the field work. The PET group for their useful discussions and
645 recommendations during the project. This work was performed on the Abel Cluster, owned by
646 the University of Oslo and the Norwegian metacenter for High Performance Computing
647 (NOTUR), and operated by the Department for Research Computing at USIT, the University
648 of Oslo IT-department, <http://www.hpc.uio.no/>.

649 Reproducibility

650 For reproducibility purposes, all the scripts used during the data processing are available on
651 the OSF work repository <https://osf.io/9bh3p/>. New sequencing data have been deposited
652 under a single NCBI BioProject accession PRJNA631886.

653 Funding

654 This project was supported by the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme for
655 research, technological development and demonstration under the Grant agreement no.
656 606895 to the FP7-MCA-ITN MedPlant, "Phylogenetic Exploration of Medicinal Plant
657 Diversity".

658 Figure 1: Sequencing recovery and identification success for the traded samples for each
659 dataset. The figure shows the percentage of samples for which useful marker sequences were
660 successfully retrieved for molecular identification for standard barcodes, ITS, plastomes and
661 nuclear markers. No data recovered (NDR) is used to indicate samples for which no sequence
662 data was recovered or where no identification at genus level or below could be made. For the
663 samples that produced useable data, the proportion of samples that resulted in identification at
664 the genus, species and population levels is given.

665

666 Figure 2: Box-and-whiskers plots showing retrieved coverage of 443 targeted markers for
667 each sample. Identified and non-identified samples are colour coded.

668

669 Figure 3: Multispecies coalescent phylogenetic tree of the nuclear loci dataset. The reference
670 dataset includes taxon labels and herbarium accession numbers and the traded samples are
671 numbered. Supported clades with an associated geographic origin are indicated by coloured
672 bars.

673

674 Figure 4: National and international supply chains of *A. pyrethrum*. Pie charts represent the
675 proportion of *A. pyrethrum* (light and dark blue represent var. *depressus* and var. *pyrethrum*
676 respectively) and adulterated samples (orange and brown for *A. homogamos* and other
677 adulterants) by each stakeholder. We were unable to obtain samples from
678 wholesalers/middlemen in India or professional collectors in Morocco (indicated by square
679 boxes).

680

681 Figure 5: Species identification of market samples. Sample locations are shown with coloured
682 circles according to the type of stakeholder. A pie-chart with the proportions of adulteration
683 and identified species is represented for each location in (a) Morocco (native range) and (b)
684 India (exported material).

685

686 Figure 6: Map of the origin of the traded samples. The figure relates three supported clades
687 mentioned in the Figure 3. The stars indicate reference samples and the dots the traded
688 samples. The number in the circle or the star corresponds to the number of individuals.